Algorithmic Hiring in Practice: Recruiter and HR Professional's Perspectives on AI Use in Hiring

Lan Li¹, Tina Lassiter², Joohee Oh², Min Kyung Lee²

¹ School of Information and Library Science at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, ² School of Information at the University of Texas at Austin





Introduction

This study explores the use of Artificial Intelligence tools in an increasingly digital world. Building on existing research on AI in hiring, it illuminates the nuanced social factors that come into play when AI-enabled hiring tools in recruiting and screening enter recruiters and HR professionals daily work and furthers the understanding of how human and AI-enabled hiring software interact with each other.

Research Questions

- How do HR professionals interact with AI-enabled Hiring tools?
- What are the consequences of the use of Alenabled Hiring tools?

Methods

Recruitment process

Direct emails & Social media outreach (posts and direct messages)

Participants

- 15 internal and external recruiters and HR professionals with experience of AI-enabled hiring software in their job
- Participants from small, medium and large companies across different industry sectors

Interviews

Semi-structured interviews, 45-60 minutes, (June 2020-September 2020)

Coding

- Thematic analysis
- 114 concepts, 22 categories, 5 top-level themes

Background RECRUITING PHASE Decision makers Job description Advertising Recruiters and HR Managers Matching & Finding Candidates (internal and external) **SCREENING PHASE** Qualification Recruiters process Individual contributors Assessment supporting the hiring and talent sourcing process **INTERVIEWING PHASE HR Managers** Work in a team of recruiters

SELECTION PHASE

The hiring funnel (left) shows critical decision points in the hiring process

Inspiration taken from Bogen, M. and A. Rieke. "Help wanted: an examination of hiring algorithms, equity, and bias." (2018).

Recruitment Phase

and/or HR professionals

(Talent Scarcity)

Use of Al-Enabled Sourcing Software to find candidates

- Smart matching
- Ranking algorithm
- Recommender engines

Screening Phase

(Applicant glut)



Use of Al-Enabled Assessment Software to screen candidates

- Task-based assessments
- Video-based assessments
- Game-based assessments

Findings

Al-enabled Talent Sourcing Software

- Competitive Advantage
- Sourcing Software as learning resource
- Lack of precise control over sourcing results
- Mismatch between Algorithmic results and recruiter's expectations
- Short-life span and data accuracy
- " It can hurt recruiters that don't have access to AI software..." (P9)
- "I'd rather they bring additional manual features back..." (P18)

Al-enabled Applicant Assessment Software

- Increased candidate participation in screening
- Challenges in assessment completion
- Efficiency of the evaluation process
- o Reduced recruiter bias
- o Shifts in HR professionals' role
- "It basically eliminated a lot of the opportunity for bias and discrimination." (P5)
- " recruiters ... probably felt a little threatened that their roles would be less important" (P19)

Discussion

Sourcing phase

- Differing attitudes of recruiters toward use of Alenabled sourcing software. Some are skeptical, others embrace it (*Complacency and Automation bias*)
- → Question: How much precise control should increasingly Al-driven sourcing tools preserve for its users? (Control and Trust)

Assessment phase

- Shift from highly human-centric assessment to more automated assessment
- As the scale of hire increases, the inclusion of recruiters' involvement decreased?
- → Question: Where should the line between the recruiters and AI-enabled hiring software be drawn? (Augmentation vs. Replacement, *Human* in the Loop discussion)

Conclusion

AI-Enabled Sourcing tools

- Tend to be seen favorable by HR professionals
- Desire for more manual control
- Short life-span

Al-Enabled Assessment tools

- Some resistance among HR professionals
- Increasing automation shifts roles of HR professionals

Acknowledgments

We thank all the recruiters and HR professionals for their insights and support.

Thank you also to the School of Information at the University of Texas at Austin for supporting our project.